



Journal of the Oriental Numismatic Society

No. 248
Summer 2022

ISSN 1818-1252



coin could be listed as no. 532b. No. 634 is not a forgery of a half-skar coin of Xuan Tong, but a fake copper striking of the silver shokang of the same era. It should be listed as no. 432c. The 2½-skar coin no. 680 has the wrong illustration which shows twice, the obverse of no. 680a.

While the estimated values assigned to the coins in the first edition were very low and probably represented the prices for which the author hoped to be able to buy the coins, the estimates given in the new catalogue mostly are realistic market values and reflect the price increases which Tibetan coins have experienced during the last ten years.

Despite my few critical remarks I wish to say that the author has done a great job, that his new catalogue is the most comprehensive presentation of Tibetan coins which presently exists and that I can recommend it to any serious collector and to institutions which own collections of Tibetan coins and/or banknotes.

Appendix:

List of books on Tibetan coins mentioned with incomplete bibliographical data by Yin Zhengmin in the English version of his preface, page 4.

- Xiao Huaiyuan (1987) *Xi zang di fang huo bi shi* [The History of Tibetan Money] Min zu chu ban she (People's Publishing House), Beijing
- Zhu Jinzhong (chief ed.), Wang Haiyan, Wang Jiafeng, Zhang Wuyi, Wu Hanlin, Wang Dui [dbang 'dus] and Tsering Pincuo (2002) *Zhong guo xi zang qian bi* [The Money of Chinese Tibet] Xi zang zi zhi ou qian bi xue hui [Tibet Autonomous Region Numismatic Society], Zhong hua shu ju, Beijing
- Huang P'eng-hsiao (Huang Peng-xiao) (1937) *Coins of the Ch'ing Dynasty*, Peking Old Palace Museum
- Li Dongyuan (1959) *Xizang you bi kao* [Studies of Tibetan Post Stamps and Coins], Taipei
- Wang Haiyan (2007) *Xi zang di fang huo bi* [The regional money of Tibet]. Zang xue wen ku (Tibetology Series). Qing hai ren min chu ban she (Qinghai Peoples's Publishing House), Xining 326 pages, coins are illustrated in black and white; banknotes and printing blocks are illustrated in colour.
- Gabrisch, K. (1990) *Geld aus Tibet: Ausstellung des Münzkabinetts der Stadt Winterthur. 27. September 1989 bis 12. August 1990*, Winterthur and Rikon, 118 pp and 43 plates.
- Bertsch, W. (2012) *The Paper Currency of Tibet*, Thyaka Research Centre, Gundernhausen near Darmstadt (Germany) and Lalitpur (Nepal), vi + 274 pp, ISBN 9789993398271
- Wang Chun Li (2012) *Illustrated Catalogue of Chinese Gold and Silver Coins; 1791–1949* [Zhong guo jin yin bi mu lu], Zhong guo shang ye chu ban she (China Trade Publishing House), Beijing, ISBN 078 7 5044 7683 8
- The Tibet chapter of this catalogue lists and illustrates most Tibetan silver and gold coins by date with estimated values in Chinese yuan. The listing is less comprehensive than YZM, but more detailed than L & M or Dong Wenchao.
- Zhang Cheng Guang (responsible ed.), Zhao Weng Sheng, Tu Hong Qiu, Zhang Ming Cong and Wang Tian Fu (authors) (2011) *Sichuan Zangyang: Si kron bod dngul* [Sichuan Tibet money = Sichuan Rupee]. Zhong guo guo ji wen yi chu ban she (China International Art Publishing House), n.p. (Beijing?), ISBN 978 988 19593 0 0/W 697.
- Jia Lin (2002) *Xi zang jin yin fen qing yu zang bi da guan*. [Collection of Tibetan Bullion Customs and Tibetan coins] Sichuan mei shu chu ban she (Sichuan Fine Arts Publishing

House), Chengdu, ISBN 7 5410 2119 9/J.1898

Cao Gang (1999) *Zhong guo xi zang di feng huo bi* [Chinese Tibet's Regional Currency], Sichuan Minzu Chubanshe, Chengdu, ISBN 7 5409 2203 6/C.37

Wolfgang Bertsch
Independent scholar

Hunnic Peoples in Central and South Asia: Sources for their origin and history, edited by Dániel Balogh
Groningen, 2020
Hardback, xxx + 437 pp

This extremely useful 400-plus page volume gathers together all the primary sources of information on the Huns of early medieval Central and South Asia. It was a product of the project *Beyond Boundaries: Religion, region, language and the state* funded by the European Research Council and led by Michael Willis at the British Museum. To quote Willis in his foreword to this book, 'The political and chronological horizon [of the project] was the Gupta dynasty and their contemporaries in the fourth, fifth and sixth centuries CE [and its] purpose [was] to . . . recover a . . . compelling and complete picture of early medieval Asia.'

The Guptas, of course, were a quintessentially Indian dynasty, who ruled much of northern India during the time period in question. While much of their focus through their reign was on the area included in modern day India, one of the foreign dynasties with whom they came into vigorous and violent contact was the Huns. Thus it is impossible to study the Guptas without also studying the Huns. This sourcebook, conceived by Hans Bakker, aims to further the study of the Huns by gathering in one place the many disparate sources of information about them.

The source material covered includes literary and epigraphic sources, along with numismatic and sigillary evidence. This information is scattered in so many places that to have it gathered all in one place is a boon for the researcher. Further, sources that are normally difficult or even impossible to access are all included. Thus the material includes Chinese, Khotanese, Pahlavi, Sogdian, Bactrian, Armenian, Syriac, Arabic (including Islamic and Christian), Greek and Latin, and Indic sources. All the references are provided in the original language along with English translation and then interpretative commentaries. Where different members of the research team had differing interpretations of texts, these different opinions are noted, allowing the reader to make up their own mind as to the correct interpretation.

The book opens with a handy timeline of events, created by Bakker, surrounding the Huns in Central and South Asia. It begins with their arrival in the middle of the fourth century in Bactria and also in India (i.e., south of the Hindu Kush mountains) and ends in the late 560s with the conquest of Bactria from the Hephthalites by Khusraw and the establishment of peace in northern India under the Maukhari king of Kanauj, Sarvavarman.

We then proceed to the information sources themselves. First are the Chinese sources, contributed by Chiang Chao-jung, Imre Galambos, Max Deeg and Inaba Minoru. This is the longest chapter in the book, over 110 pages, reflecting the

wide variety of sources and the frequent mention of the Huns, who, after all, originated on the Chinese borderlands. The presentation of the material has been optimized for usefulness. Rather than simply providing in one place all the entries, say, in the *Weishu* that refer to the Huns, the entries are provided separately in different sections referring to specific topics. Thus there are entries from the *Weishu* in sections on Dong Wan's mission in 437 CE, on Song Yun's mission of 518–22, on the Yeda (i.e., Hephthalites) generally, on their expansion, on their population, on their court, political system and economy, on the characteristics of ordinary people, on their language and script, on their funeral customs, on their international status, on their wars, and on their tribute payments to China. I provide this exhaustive list to give the reader a sense of the detail to which the authors have gone. Within each section, material from other sources are interspersed with that from the *Weishu* and other sources.

Next, Mauro Maggi reviews the Khotanese and Frantz Grenet the Pahlavi sources. The dearth of material in Pahlavi is a real surprise, considering how much interaction the Sasanians had with the Huns and how well developed the Sasanian state was. There are only two entries here, neither very informative. This is followed by the extremely informative material in the Sogdian and, especially, the Bactrian sources, reviewed by Nicholas Sims-Williams. I suspect more information is to emerge from the Bactrian documents.

There is a very interesting section on the Armenian sources, authored by Giusto Traina, extending to 24 pages. These are much less familiar to most researchers, but the Armenian sources provide information on a number of topics, including the war of Shapur with the Kidarites, the war of Yazdegerd against the Huns, the defeat of the Sasanians at Herat and the use of Hun troops in the battle of Peroz against the Albanians. The chapter on Armenian sources is followed by chapters on the Syriac sources (by Mark Dickens and Christelle Jullien) and the Arabic literature, both Islamic (by Étienne de la Vaissière) and Christian (Mark Dickens and Orsolya Varsányi).

We next have over 50 pages on the Greek and Latin sources, authored by Timo Stickler. These will be more familiar to most readers but of course they are an essential part of this compendium. A total of 13 sources is cited, from the most familiar such as Priscus, Ammianus and Procopius, to lesser known authors such as Agathias of Myrina and Ioannes Lydus.

The last chapter of textual sources is on the Indic material, studied by Hans Bakker, Csaba Dezső, Gergely Hidas and Dániel Balogh. This is the second-longest chapter in the book, extending to some 90 pages. The most important material here is of course the various inscriptions of the Gupta and Hun kings, but there are references to the Huns in a wide variety of places and all are covered. I was particularly happy to see a substantial entry for the *Mañjuśrīmūlakalpa*, which is given short shrift by some authors.

The last chapter in the book, by Robert Bracey, covers the numismatic and sigillary evidence. This includes a very useful concordance of the coins listed in Göbl's seminal work on the coins of the Iranian Huns with more recent works by Cribb, Pfisterer and Vondrovec. There are also lists of the Bactrian, Brāhmī and Pahlavi legends found on coins. Finally, 43 coins are illustrated in full colour.

The book closes with 22 pages of references, and a detailed seven-page index to allow the reader quick access to entries on any one topic in all of the different sources. Handsomely published in hard cover by Barkhuis, this will be an indispensable resource for all researchers in the field and to anyone interested in the history of the period.

Pankaj Tandon
Boston University

The Alkhan: A Hunnic people in South Asia

by Hans T. Bakker
 Groningen, 2020
 Hardback, xiii + 128 pp

This slim but brilliant volume is a companion to the *Sourcebook* on the Huns (reviewed above). Although coins play only a minor role in the presentation, students of the Huns will find it indispensable, as it gathers together in one place several advances made by Bakker in a series of papers published in different places. That is why it is reviewed here. It is a wonderful example of what can be achieved in our understanding of a topic once a knowledgeable and imaginative scholar has all the sources of information on that particular topic at his fingertips. In that sense, it is indeed an outgrowth of the project to gather all the primary sources of information on the Huns into one volume. Specifically, it is a reconstruction of the history of the Alkhan Huns in India based on the source material collected in the *Sourcebook*.

Bakker begins with the well-known history of the Huns, starting with the appearance of the Kidarites in the mid-fourth century both north and south of the Hindu Kush mountains. Seals and coins play an important role in establishing their presence in the area. The Alkhan were a related tribe and they appear to have replaced the Kidarites in the Kabul valley, Gandhara and Punjab late in the century. Again, coins are a crucial part of this story. Bakker subscribes to Pfisterer's theory that the Alkhan formed a quadripartite confederacy, perhaps immortalized in the famous Swat bowl. This silver bowl, in the collection of the British Museum, shows four royal Hun hunters, thereby providing concrete evidence of a 'quadrumvirate' and also suggesting that the Alkhan and Kidarites were in an alliance.

Bakker points out an aspect of the bowl that is not often discussed: an inscription that was apparently punched onto the bowl after its creation. After noting various attempts to read this legend, none satisfactory, Bakker proposes to read *khīngi* (perhaps denoting *Khīngila*), followed by two numerals, perhaps reading 206, with the letter *ka* (perhaps denoting Kidara). Assuming 206 represents a date, Bakker was unable to provide a good explanation for what year this might represent. He also notes that Harry Falk proposed that the *ka* stood for *karshapana*, a silver weight, so that 206 *ka* might represent the silver weight of the bowl. However, the weight of the bowl is actually only about half of what we might expect 206 karshapanas to weigh, leading to the suggestion that 206 *ka* might stand for the total weight of a pair of bowls, of which the Swat bowl is only one. Although the discussion is inconclusive, it is nevertheless fascinating and one that all students of the period must keep in mind.